

# **BEST COPY AVAILABLE**

## **PUBLISHER'S NOTICE**

Material on the following frames is  
the best copy available to publisher.

phy. 0  
In former caption  
Petition not printed

Office - Supreme Court, U. S.

FILED

DEC 21 1944

✓  
CHARLES ELMORE GROPLER

IN THE

**Supreme Court of the United States**

OCTOBER TERM 1944

No. 726

TINDARO CHARLES GAGLIO,

*Petitioner,*

against

THE CITY OF NEW YORK,

*Respondent.*

---

**BRIEF FOR RESPONDENT**

---

December 23, 1944.

IGNATIUS M. WILKINSON,

*Corporation Counsel,*

*Attorney for Defendant-Respondent,*

385 Flatbush Avenue Extension,

Brooklyn, New York City.

ALBERT L. WILBUR,

of Counsel.

---

---



## INDEX

	PAGE
Reports of Opinions by Courts Below.....	1
Grounds of Jurisdiction.....	3
Statement of Material Facts.....	3
1—Nature of Action.....	3
2—Substance of Negligence Alleged.....	3
3—Nature of the Defense.....	4
4—Plaintiff's Evidence as to Accident.....	4
5—Defendant's Evidence as to Accident.....	6
6—Plaintiff's Evidence as to Lighting Conditions..	8
7—Defendant's Evidence as to Lighting Conditions	9
POINT 1—Writ of certiorari should not be granted because the questions involved do not bring the case within the purview of the Federal statute governing issuance of the writ (28 U. S. C. A., Sec. 347-a) or of the Revised Rules of the Supreme Court of the United States (Rule 38, Sec. 5, subds. a, b, c).....	9
POINT 2—The Federal Rules of Civil Practice (Rule 50-b) specifically authorize the Court to reserve decision and to set aside a jury verdict and direct judgment after verdict. The Trial Judge, in following that rule, did not deny to the petitioner his right to trial by jury, as claimed by the petition (Point I, at p. 7).....	12

	PAGE
POINT 3—Judgment for the City was properly directed and affirmed upon the ground that Section 40 of the New York State War Emergency Act grants immunity to the municipality from liability for injury to any person as a result of the City's complying with or attempting in good faith to comply with "dimout" regulations.....	15
1. Evidence of precautionary measures taken in compliance with Major General Terry's dimout order of June 1, 1942.....	16
2. Plaintiff's failure to prove any act of negligence on the City's part.....	22
POINT 4—The Trial Court properly directed a verdict for the City on the further ground that the plaintiff's own proofs showed him to have been guilty of contributory negligence as a matter of law.....	23
POINT 5—Plaintiff's failure to serve a "notice of claim and intention to sue" within six months after the happening of the accident constituted a fatal defect requiring dismissal of his complaint as a matter of law (Administrative Code, Sec. 394a-1.0).....	27
CONCLUSION .....	29

# CASES CITED

	PAGE
Baltimore & Carolina Line v. Redman, 295 U. S. 654.....	12, 13
Capitula v. N. Y. Cent. R. R. Co., 200 App. Div. 247.....	23
Culhane v. N. Y. Cent. R. R. Co., 60 N. Y. 133.....	23
Curry v. City of Buffalo, 135 N. Y. 366.....	28
Fratia v. Grace Line, Inc., 139 Fed. (2d) 743.....	14
Foley v. N. Y. Cent. R. R. Co., 197 N. Y. 430.....	23
Gaglio v. City of New York, 143 Fed. (2d) 904.....	2
Galloway v. United States, 319 U. S. 372.....	12
Hudson v. Church of Holy Trinity, 250 N. Y. 513.....	26
Magnum Importing Co. v. Coty, 262 U. S. 159.....	10
Owen v. Westchester Country Club, 264 App. Div. 796.....	25
Piper v. N. Y. Cent. R. R. Co., 156 N. Y. 224.....	24
Rogers v. Village of Port Chester, 234 N. Y. 182.....	28
Slocum v. N. Y. Life Ins. Co., 228 U. S. 364.....	13, 14
The Buenos Aires, 5 Fed. (2d) 425.....	23
The Fin MacCool, 147 Fed. 123.....	23
Trust v. City of New York, 285 N. Y. 589.....	28
Weller v. Consol. Gas Co., 198 N. Y. 98.....	26

# STATUTES, ETC.

New York City Administrative Code (L. 1937, Ch. 929), Sec. 349a-1.0.....	4, 27, 28
Judicial Code: 28 U. S. C. A., Sec. 347-a.....	9
Revised Rules of Supreme Court of the United States: Rule 38, Sec. 5, subds. a, b and c.....	9, 10
Federal Rules of Civil Practice: Rule 50-b.....	12
New York State War Emergency Act (L. 1942, Ch. 554): Section 40.....	15
United States Army Regulations Governing Control of Artificial Lighting.....	16